

Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta

No. 46

# VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS 

Wednesday, November 24, 2010
The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

## Members' Statements

Mr. Vandermeer, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Beverly-Clareview, made a statement regarding Habitat for Humanity Edmonton's Anderson Garden development.

Mr. Taylor, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie, made a statement regarding Members of the Legislative Assembly working together to offer solutions to the health care crisis.

Ms Calahasen, Hon. Member for Lesser Slave Lake, made a statement regarding the Northern Student Teacher Bursary, a joint initiative between Alberta Education, Alberta Scholarship Programs, and the Northern Alberta Development Council.

Ms Woo-Paw, Hon. Member for Calgary-Mackay, made a statement regarding the achievements of several schools in the Calgary-Mackay constituency.

Mrs. Sarich, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Decore, made a statement regarding the opening of the Edmonton-North Alberta Works office on May 21, 2010.

Mr. Hinman, Hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore, made a statement regarding democracy and government accountability.

## Speaker's Statement - Cameras in the Chamber

This morning when I arrived at my office, because I could not join Members at 1:35 or 2:00 this morning because you were in committee, a number of Members brought to my attention a very serious violation of our rules and ethics which occurred in this House at approximately 1:30 in the morning.

The transgression goes to the very heart of the integrity of this Assembly and the right of Members to do their work and the security and the privacy of Members in this Assembly. Cameras and the taking of pictures is strictly prohibited in this Assembly, and at least several Members - that is, more than two - identified one particular Member who was undertaking such an activity.

This Chair has made mention of this for going on nearly 14 years, so it's not the first time it's been raised. It's raised in a letter that's sent to all Members prior to the commencement of a Session.

No Member rose last night on a point of privilege. That would have been the right of a Member, to rise on the point of privilege. The Member in question who committed this unethical transgression has been talked to by the Sergeant-at-Arms, has admitted it, and has apologized. I want to assure all Members that if such an unethical transgression repeats itself in this Assembly, it is your responsibility and duty as a Member of this Assembly to rise on a point of privilege, and we will deal with it in the Assembly on the subsequent day.

Members in this Assembly are elected to have all the freedom and all the rights of privacy and privilege when they work in this Assembly, and they are not to be interfered with by anyone, intimidated by anyone under the guise of whatever it is. It is not a joking matter in the eyes and the mind of this Chair, this Speaker. You have every right - every right. I'll tell you why. I'll give you an example of why intimidation is so important. In 1933 in another country in this world, in the national Assembly of the Reichstag in Germany, storm troopers came into the Assembly and stood beside Members who did not want to vote for the Nazi Party and intimidated the living daylights out of them to vote themselves out of existence.

It is a fundamental right for Members to be in this Assembly and to have every right without harassment, intimidation, interference from any other Member to do their particular duties. I raise that, but if Members are aware of this, they must bring it to the attention of other Members, and they must deal with it.

## Presenting Petitions

Mr. Doerksen, Hon. Member for Strathmore-Brooks on behalf of Hon. Mr. Snelgrove, Hon. Member for Vermilion-Lloydminster (President of the Treasury Board), presented a petition from 7,000 Albertans urging the Government to implement the following changes at the intersection of Highway 16 and Highway 897: within six weeks of September 15, 2010, post signs warning drivers of an "important intersection ahead" and start the construction of extending all turning and acceleration lanes to a safe and reasonable distance and within one and one half years of September 15, 2010, start construction on an overpass to permit the safe travel of traffic on this section of highway.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 21 Albertans urging the Government to immediately abandon plans to increase the role of private insurance in the health care system, and instead, commit to strengthening the single-payer, public system.

## Notices of Motions

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Assembly waive Standing Order 3(4)(b) and extend the Fall sitting as provided for under Standing Order 3(9).

## Tabling Returns and Reports

Mr. Mason, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands-Norwood:
Reprint of a Calgary Herald article dated August 12, 2008, entitled "Health minister's reforms are far from scary; He wants to make changes but the system is in no danger"

Ms Pastoor, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East:
3 letters, the first dated February 26, 2010, to Camellia Saretzy, Crowsnest Food Bank, the second dated March 31, 2010, to Mable Both, Claresholm Food Bank, and the third dated April 30, 2010, to Brenda English, Vulcan Food Bank, from Ms Pastoor, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, pledging a donation to the food bank equal to one-half of Ms Pastoor's 4.9 percent salary increase, with attached copy of Ms Pastoor's cheques

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:
Letter dated August 4, 2010, from Hon. Mr. Liepert, Minister of Energy, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, responding to a letter from Mr. MacDonald to Hon. Dr. Morton, Minister of Finance and Enterprise, regarding the Government of Alberta's 2009/2010 Annual Report Sessional Paper 413/2010

E-mail message dated December 17, 2009, from Vanessa Pierce to Hon. Mr. Stelmach, Premier, Hon. Mr. Liepert, Minister of Health and Wellness, and Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, expressing opposition to the government's plan to close acute psychiatric care beds at Alberta Hospital Edmonton

Sessional Paper 414/2010
Mrs. Forsyth, Hon. Member for Calgary-Fish Creek:
Petition signed by several hundred Albertans urging the Legislative Assembly to rescind Bill 24, Adult Guardianship and Trusteeship Act, 2009

Sessional Paper 415/2010
Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:
E-mail message dated November 19, 2010, from Charmaine Roux of Edmonton to Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, requesting the government increase Assured Income for the Severely Handicapped benefits

Sessional Paper 416/2010
Mr. Chase, Hon. Member for Calgary-Varsity:
Several recent e-mail messages to several Members of the Legislative Assembly expressing concern regarding Bill 29, Alberta Parks Act Sessional Paper 417/2010

## Tablings to the Clerk

Clerk of the Assembly on behalf of Mr. McFarland, Hon. Member for Little Bow:
Copy of a petition signed by 66 Coaldale and area residents requesting amendments to section 7(1)(c) of the Alberta Human Rights Act

Sessional Paper 418/2010

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

## Government Motions

20. Moved by Hon. Mr. Hancock:

Be it resolved that the Assembly invite Their Excellencies The Right Honourable David Johnston, CC, CMM, COM, CD, Governor General of Canada, and Mrs. Sharon Johnston, CC, to the floor of this Chamber in order to have His Excellency address the Legislative Assembly on Monday, November 29, 2010, and that this address be the first order of business after Prayers following which the ordinary business of the Assembly will resume notwithstanding the designated times stipulated in Standing Order 7(1).

Be it further resolved that His Excellency's address become part of the permanent record of the Assembly.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to.

## Government Bills and Orders

## Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole and the Speaker left the Chair.
(Assembly in Committee)
The following Bill was taken under consideration:
Bill 17 Alberta Health Act - Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky
Debate continued on the amendment introduced by Mr. Anderson, Hon. Member for Airdrie-Chestermere, on November 23, 2010, that Bill 17, Alberta Health Act, be amended in the last recital of the Preamble by adding ", namely that health insurance coverage is publicly administered, comprehensive, universal, portable and accessible" after "Canada Health Act (Canada)".

The question being put, the amendment was defeated. With Mr. Cao at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:
For the amendment: 5
Anderson
Forsyth
Sherman
Boutilier
Hinman

Against the amendment: 38

| Ady | Goudreau | Pastoor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Allred | Hancock | Prins |
| Berger | Horner | Renner |
| Bhullar | Jablonski | Rogers |
| Blackett | Johnson | Sandhu |
| Blakeman | Johnston | Sarich |
| Brown | Klimchuk | Snelgrove |
| Campbell | Liepert | Tarchuk |
| Chase | Lukaszuk | VanderBurg |
| Dallas | MacDonald | Webber |
| DeLong | Marz | Xiao |
| Denis | McFarland | Zwozdesky |
| Drysdale | Oberle |  |

## Adjournment

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(4), the Committee recessed at 6:00 p.m. until 7:30 p.m.
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2010 - 7:30 P.M.

## Government Bills and Orders

## Committee of the Whole

(Assembly in Committee)
The following Bill was taken under consideration:
Bill 28 Electoral Divisions Act - Hon. Ms Redford
Mr. Boutilier moved adjournment of the debate, which was defeated. With Mr. Mitzel at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:
For the motion: 9

| Anderson | Hinman | Pastoor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Boutilier | Kang | Sherman |
| Forsyth | Mason | Taft |

Against the motion: 23

| Ady | Drysdale | Morton |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Allred | Goudreau | Sandhu |
| Benito | Hayden | Sarich |
| Bhullar | Johnson | Snelgrove |
| Brown | Johnston | Tarchuk |
| Dallas | Klimchuk | Webber |
| Denis | Lukaszuk | Woo-Paw |
| Doerksen | Marz |  |

Mr. Hinman moved adjournment of the debate, which was defeated. With Mr. Mitzel at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 8

| Anderson | Hinman | Pastoor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Boutilier | Kang | Taft |
| Forsyth | Mason |  |

Against the motion: 24

| Ady | Drysdale | Sandhu |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Allred | Goudreau | Sarich |
| Benito | Johnson | Snelgrove |
| Berger | Klimchuk | Tarchuk |
| Bhullar | Lukaszuk | Webber |
| Brown | Marz | Woo-Paw |
| Campbell | Oberle | Xiao |
| Denis | Prins | Zwozdesky |

Hon. Mr. Lukaszuk moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to. With Mr. Cao at the Table, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 31

| Ady | Hancock | Ouellette |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Allred | Hayden | Prins |
| Benito | Horne | Quest |
| Bhullar | Jacobs | Rodney |
| Blackett | Johnson | Rogers |
| Campbell | Knight | Sarich |
| Dallas | Lukaszuk | Snelgrove |
| Denis | Mason | Tarchuk |
| Elniski | McQueen | VanderBurg |
| Evans | Notley | Zwozdesky |

Fritz

Against the motion: 10

| Boutilier | Kang | Swann |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Chase | Pastoor | Taft |
| Forsyth | Sherman | Taylor |
| Hinman |  |  |

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.
Progress was reported on the following Bills:
Bill 17 Alberta Health Act - Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky
Bill 28 Electoral Divisions Act — Hon. Ms Redford
Mr. VanderBurg, Acting Chair of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 17 (A2) (introduced by the Hon. Member for AirdrieChestermere on November 23, 2010) - Defeated on division

Sessional Paper 410/2010
Amendment to Bill 17 (A3) (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark) Adjourned debate

Sessional Paper 419/2010
Amendment to Bill 28 (A1) (introduced by the Hon. Member for CalgaryCurrie on November 23, 2010) - Agreed to

Sessional Paper 408/2010
Amendment to Bill 28 (SA1) (Hon. Government House Leader) — Agreed to

Sessional Paper 420/2010
Amendment to Bill 28 (A2) (Hon. Member for Airdrie-Chestermere) Adjourned debate

Sessional Paper 421/2010

## Third Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:
Bill 26 Mines and Minerals (Coalbed Methane) Amendment Act, 2010 - Hon. Mr. Hancock on behalf of Hon. Mr. Liepert

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was agreed to. With Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, the names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 39

| Ady | Hayden | Pastoor |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Allred | Horne | Prins |
| Benito | Jacobs | Quest |
| Bhullar | Johnson | Rodney |
| Blackett | Kang | Rogers |
| Campbell | Klimchuk | Sandhu |
| Cao | Lukaszuk | Sarich |
| Dallas | Mason | Sherman |
| Denis | McQueen | Snelgrove |
| Drysdale | Mitzel | Swann |
| Elniski | Notley | Taft |
| Evans | Oberle | Tarchuk |
| Hancock | Ouellette | VanderBurg |

Against the motion: 2
Boutilier
Anderson

The following Bills were read a Third time and passed:
Bill 20 Class Proceedings Amendment Act, 2010 - Mr. Drysdale
Bill 21 Wills and Succession Act - Hon. Mr. Denis on behalf of Mr. Olson
Bill 22 Family Law Statutes Amendment Act, 2010 - Hon. Mr. Denis on behalf of Hon. Ms Redford

Bill 26 Mines and Minerals (Coalbed Methane) Amendment Act, 2010 - Hon. Mr. Hancock on behalf of Hon. Mr. Liepert

## Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole and the Speaker left the Chair.
(Assembly in Committee)
And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker assumed the Chair.
Progress was reported on the following Bills:
Bill 17 Alberta Health Act - Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky
Bill 27 Police Amendment Act, 2010 - Hon. Mr. Oberle
Mr. VanderBurg, Acting Chair of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 27 (A1) (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview on behalf of the Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) - Agreed to

Sessional Paper 422/2010
Amendment to Bill 27 (A2) (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview on behalf of the Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) - Agreed to

Sessional Paper 423/2010
Amendment to Bill 17 (A3) (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark) Adjourned debate

Sessional Paper 419/2010

## Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 4:30 p.m. on Thursday, November 25, 2010, until Monday, November 29, 2010, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski, Speaker

